Attorney General Asks Congress to Hold Internet Service Providers Accountable, Ensure States Maintain Right to Stop Criminal Violations of State Law

HONOLULU – Attorney General Clare E. Connors joined 47 Attorneys General across the country this week to ask Congress, again, to amend the Communications Decency Act in order to make sure state and local authorities are able to protect our citizens online and take appropriate action against criminal actors.

The Communication Decency Act of 1996 (CDA) was designed to encourage the growth of the internet by promoting free expression, particularly on online message boards. The Act was intended to allow companies who sponsor message boards to remain immune to repercussions from inappropriate posts, but, due to a misinterpretation of Section 230 of the Act, some federal court opinions have interpreted it so broadly that individuals and services that knowingly aid and profit from illegal activity have evaded prosecution.

“Stop Enabling Sex Traffickers Act” and “Allow States and Victims to Fight Online Sex Trafficking Act” (known as FOSTA-SESTA) was signed into law in 2018, making clear that the CDA’s immunity does not apply to enforcement of federal or state sex trafficking laws. Unfortunately, the abuse on these platforms does not stop at sex trafficking, but includes all sorts of harmful illegal activity such as online black market opioid sales, identity theft, and election meddling.

Section 230 expressly exempts prosecution of federal crimes from the safe harbor, but “addressing criminal activity cannot be relegated to federal enforcement alone simply because the activity occurs online,” the letter states. “Attorneys General must be allowed to address these crimes themselves and fulfill our primary mandate to protect our citizens and enforce their rights.”

Attorneys General have addressed this issue with Congress before. In 2013 and 2017, nearly every state and territory Attorney General wrote to inform Congress of the damaging misinterpretation and misapplication of Section 230 of the CDA.
**Attorney General Connors** said, "Amending the CDA to clarify its application will enable our state law enforcement offices to take action consistent with the original intent of the law."

In addition to Hawaii, the following states joined in this letter: Mississippi, Texas, Alabama, Alaska, Arkansas, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Florida, Georgia, Guam, Idaho, Indiana, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Maine, Maryland, Massachusetts, Michigan, Minnesota, Missouri, Montana, Nebraska, Nevada, New Hampshire, New Jersey, New Mexico, New York, North Carolina, North Dakota, Ohio, Oklahoma, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, South Carolina, South Dakota, Tennessee, Utah, Vermont, Virginia, Washington, West Virginia, Wisconsin, the District of Columbia, Guam, and Puerto Rico.

A copy of the letter is attached.  

###

For more information, contact:

Krishna F. Jayaram  
Special Assistant to the Attorney General  
(808) 586-1284  
Email: Krishna.F.Jayaram@hawaii.gov  
Web: [http://ag.hawaii.gov](http://ag.hawaii.gov)  
Twitter: @ATGHIgov
May 23, 2019

Chair                   Ranking Member
House Committee on the Judiciary
2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg.
Washington, DC 20515    House Committee on the Judiciary
2138 Rayburn House Office Bldg.
Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Lindsey Graham    Sen. Dianne Feinstein
Chair                   Ranking Member
Senate Committee on the Judiciary
224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg.
Washington, DC 20510    Senate Committee on the Judiciary
224 Dirksen Senate Office Bldg.
Washington, DC 20510

Chair                   Ranking Member
House Committee on Energy
and Commerce
2125 Rayburn House Office Bldg.
Washington, DC 20515    House Committee on Energy
and Commerce
2322 Rayburn Bldg.
Washington, DC 20515

Sen. Roger Wicker       Sen. Maria Cantwell
Chair                   Ranking Member
Senate Committee on Commerce,
Science, and Transportation
512 Dirksen Senate Bldg.
Washington, DC 20510    Senate Committee on Commerce,
Science, and Transportation
512 Dirksen Senate Bldg.
Washington, DC 20510

RE: Amendment of Communications Decency Act (CDA)

Dear Congressional Leaders:

In 2013 and again in 2017, Attorneys General from virtually every state and
territory wrote to inform Congress of a damaging misinterpretation and
misapplication of Section 230 of the Communications Decency Act of 1996
(CDA) that rendered state and local authorities unable to enforce criminal
laws against companies that actively profited from the promotion and
facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children. To be sure, we are
grateful for all the work you have done to protect the vulnerable among us. To
bootstrap your efforts, we renew our recommendation for a modest but
necessary amendment to the CDA. We must enable our state and local
authorities to protect our citizens, including the most vulnerable among us,
and to take appropriate action against criminal actors.
As noted in our earlier letters, some federal court opinions have interpreted the CDA so broadly that the perverse result has been to protect individuals and services that knowingly aid and profit from illegal activity online at the expense of the victims for whom the protection was intended. To that end, the impropriety of Section 230’s application to businesses that profited from the knowing promotion and facilitation of sex trafficking and crimes against children prompted Congress to enact the “Stop Enabling Sex Traffickers Act” and “Allow States and Victims to Fight Online Sex Trafficking Act” (known as FOSTA-SESTA). This bill, signed into law in 2018, provides that the CDA’s immunity does not apply to enforcement of federal or state sex trafficking laws.

While we welcome the ability to pursue some of the Internet’s most pernicious actors under FOSTA-SESTA, we sadly note that the abuse on these platforms does not stop at sex trafficking. Stories of online black market opioid sales, ID theft, deep fakes, election meddling, and foreign intrusion are now ubiquitous, and these growing phenomena will undoubtedly serve as the subjects of hearings throughout the 116th Congress. Current precedent interpreting the CDA, however, continues to preclude states and territories from enforcing their criminal laws against companies that, while not actually performing these unlawful activities, provide platforms that make these activities possible. Worse, the extensive safe harbor conferred to these platforms by courts promotes an online environment where these pursuits remain attractive and profitable to all involved, including the platforms that facilitate them.

Addressing criminal activity cannot be relegated to federal enforcement alone simply because the activity occurs online. The authorities in our states must be allowed to address these crimes themselves and fulfill our primary mandate to protect our citizens and enforce their rights. We therefore renew our recommendation that 47 U.S.C. § 230(e)(1) be amended to the following (added language in bold):

Nothing in this section shall be construed to impair the enforcement of section 223 or 231 of this title, chapter 71 (relating to obscenity) or 110 (relating to sexual exploitation of children) of title 18, or any other Federal, State, or Territorial criminal statute.

In its passage of FOSTA-SESTA, Congress understood that the immense challenges presented by sex trafficking on the Internet must be shared by Federal and State authorities. The increasing challenges presented by profiteers of the many other criminal enterprises online require the same level of investigation and prosecution that can only come from inclusion of State and Local resources. We ask that you adopt this simple addition to the CDA to remove the law’s restrictions on enforcement and enable us to better protect citizens nationwide.

Respectfully,

Jim Hood
Mississippi Attorney General

Ken Paxton
Texas Attorney General
Steve Marshall
Alabama Attorney General

Leslie Rutledge
Arkansas Attorney General

William Tong
Connecticut Attorney General

Karl A. Racine
District of Columbia Attorney General

Christopher M. Carr
Georgia Attorney General

Clare E. Connors
Hawaii Attorney General

Curtis T. Hill, Jr.
Indiana Attorney General

Andy Beshear
Kentucky Attorney General

Aaron M. Frey
Maine Attorney General

Kevin G. Clarkson
Alaska Attorney General

Phil Weiser
Colorado Attorney General

Kathleen Jennings
Delaware Attorney General

Ashley Moody
Florida Attorney General

Leevin Taitano Camacho
Guam Attorney General

Lawrence Wasden
Idaho Attorney General

Derek Schmidt
Kansas Attorney General

Jeff Landry
Louisiana Attorney General

Brian Frosh
Maryland Attorney General
Maura Healey
Massachusetts Attorney General

Keith Ellison
Minnesota Attorney General

Tim Fox
Montana Attorney General

Aaron D. Ford
Nevada Attorney General

Gurbir S. Grewal
New Jersey Attorney General

Letitia James
New York Attorney General

Wayne Stenehjem
North Dakota Attorney General

Mike Hunter
Oklahoma Attorney General

Wanda Vázquez Garced
Puerto Rico Attorney General

Dana Nessel
Michigan Attorney General

Eric S. Schmitt
Missouri Attorney General

Douglas Peterson
Nebraska Attorney General

Gordon MacDonald
New Hampshire Attorney General

Hector Balderas
New Mexico Attorney General

Josh Stein
North Carolina Attorney General

Dave Yost
Ohio Attorney General

Josh Shapiro
Pennsylvania Attorney General

Peter F. Neronha
Rhode Island Attorney General
Alan Wilson
South Carolina Attorney General

Herbert H. Slatery III
Tennessee Attorney General

T.J. Donovan
Vermont Attorney General

Robert W. Ferguson
Washington Attorney General

Joshua L. Kaul
Wisconsin Attorney General

Jason R. Ravnsborg
South Dakota Attorney General

Sean Reyes
Utah Attorney General

Mark R. Herring
Virginia Attorney General

Patrick Morrisey
West Virginia Attorney General

CC House Committee on the Judiciary Members
Senate Committee on the Judiciary Members
House Committee on Energy and Commerce Members
Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation Members