December 14, 2020

The Honorable Ronald D. Kouchi  
President and Members of the Senate  
Thirty-First State Legislature  
State Capitol, Room 409  
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

The Honorable Scott K. Saiki  
Speaker and Members of the House of Representatives  
Thirty-First State Legislature  
State Capitol, Room 431  
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Dear President Kouchi, Speaker Saiki, and Members of the Legislature:

For your information and consideration, I am transmitting a copy of the Department of the Attorney General’s Annual Report on the Law Enforcement Standards Board as required by section 139-9, Hawaii Revised Statutes. In accordance with section 93-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, I am also informing you that the report may be viewed electronically at http://ag.hawaii.gov/publications/reports/reports-to-the-legislature/.

If you have any questions or concerns, please feel free to call me at 586-1500.

Sincerely,

Clare E. Connors  
Attorney General

c: David Y. Ige, Governor  
Josh Green, Lieutenant Governor  
Legislative Reference Bureau (Attn.: Karen Mau)  
Leslie H. Kondo, State Auditor  
Craig K. Hirai, Director of Finance, Department of Budget and Finance  
Stacey A. Aldrich, State Librarian, Hawaii State Public Library System  
David Lassner, PhD., President, University of Hawaii

Enclosure
State of Hawai‘i
Department of the Attorney General

REPORT ON THE LAW
ENFORCEMENT STANDARDS BOARD

Pursuant to Section 139-9, Hawaii Revised Statutes

Submitted to
The Thirty-First State Legislature
Regular Session of 2021
Section 139-9, Hawaii Revised Statutes, requires the Law Enforcement Standards Board, established within the Department of the Attorney General, State of Hawaii, to submit a report to the Legislature that includes:

(1) A description of the activities of the board;
(2) An accounting of the expenditures from the law enforcement standards board special fund in the previous fiscal year and the remaining balance of the fund; and
(3) Recommended legislation, if any.

I. The Law Enforcement Standards Board:

The Law Enforcement Standards Board (“Board”) was established by Act 220, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018, which added to the Hawaii Revised Statutes a new chapter that is codified as chapter 139. The Board is charged with providing programs and standards for training and certification of law enforcement officers. Specifically, as set forth in section 139-3, the Board shall:

(1) Adopt rules in accordance with chapter 91 to implement this chapter;
(2) Establish minimum standards for employment as a law enforcement officer and to certify persons to be qualified as law enforcement officers;
(3) Establish criteria and standards in which a person who has been denied certification, whose certification has been revoked by the board, or whose certification has lapsed may reapply for certification;
(4) Establish minimum criminal justice curriculum requirements for basic, specialized, and in-service courses and programs for schools operated by or for the State or a county for the specific purpose of training law enforcement officers;
(5) Consult and cooperate with the counties, agencies of the State, other governmental agencies, universities, colleges, and other institutions concerning the development of law enforcement officer training schools and programs of criminal justice instruction;
(6) Employ, subject to chapter 76, an administrator and other persons necessary to carry out its duties under this chapter;
(7) Investigate when there is reason to believe that a law enforcement officer does not meet the minimum standards for employment, and in so doing, may:

(A) Subpoena persons, books, records, or documents;
(B) Require answers in writing under oath to questions asked by the board; and
(C) Take or cause to be taken depositions as needed in investigations, hearings, and other proceedings, related to the investigation;

(8) Establish and require participation in continuing education programs for law enforcement officers;

(9) Have the authority to charge and collect fees for applications for certification as a law enforcement officer;

(10) Establish procedures and criteria for the revocation of certification issued by the board;

(11) Have the authority to revoke certifications; and

(12) Review and recommend statewide policies and procedures relating to law enforcement, including the use of force.

II. Activities of the Board

On May 21, 2020, the six Board members who are not ex officio members, were confirmed by the Senate. They include Samuel Jelsma, Sherry Bird, Gary Yamashiroya, Harry Kubojiri, Craig Tanaka, and Nicholas Courson.

The Board met on October 15, 2020, and completed the following:

(1) Reviewed, discussed, and approved proposed legislation to be submitted to the Legislature in the 2021 session to address funding, resources, and deadlines for the Board;

(2) Reviewed, discussed, and approved the draft "Report of the Law Enforcement Standards Board submitted to the Thirty-First State Legislature, Regular Session of 2021";

(3) Reviewed and discussed Act 47, Session Laws of Hawaii 2020, HB 285 HD 1, SD 2, CD 1, Relating to Public Safety;

(4) Discussed and approved the Chair's request to send letters on behalf of the Board to selected state Police Officer Standards Boards for information sharing and assistance in establishing Hawaii law enforcement standards;
(5) Discussed staff responsibilities, expectations, and challenges with lack of funding; and

(6) Discussed Board administrative procedures.

III. **Accounting of Expenditures**

No expenditures. The Board had no funding.

IV. **Recommended Legislation**

The Board agreed to propose legislation that would:

(1) Explain the need to delay implementation of Act 220 to allow for further study;

(2) Clarify that all ex officio members can have their designees serve on the Board;

(3) Increase the number of law enforcement officer Board members from two to five, to ensure representation from each county and the State;

(4) Delete the county police department experience restriction for the Board members who fill Board positions as members of the public;

(5) Provide that the appointment of Board members by the Governor shall not be subject to Senate confirmation;

(6) Require consideration of the Legislative Reference Bureau's study conducted pursuant to Act 124, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018, and require the Board’s own study to evaluate how to efficiently and effectively satisfy its duties in accordance with the law;

(7) Provide for the employment of a board administrator, without regard to chapter 76 civil service requirements, and one clerical position to assist the Board;

(8) Delay the effective date of the certification, training, employment, and revocation and denial requirements of Act 220 to July 1, 2023; and

(9) Request an appropriation of $292,500 to cover the costs of staffing and Board expenses for the next year.
The Board’s proposed legislation will be submitted for inclusion in the Administration’s legislative package. A copy of the Board’s proposed legislation is attached hereto as Appendix A.
A BILL FOR AN ACT

RELATING TO LAW ENFORCEMENT.

BE IT ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE OF THE STATE OF HAWAI‘I:

SECTION 1. The legislature, by Act 220, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018, enacted chapter 139, Hawaii Revised Statutes, to create a law enforcement standards board for the certification of law enforcement officers, including county police officers, state public safety officers, and employees with police powers at the department of transportation, department of land and natural resources, department of the attorney general, and department of taxation.

The board is responsible for establishing minimum standards for employment as a law enforcement officer and certifying persons qualified as law enforcement officers. It is also responsible for establishing minimum criminal justice curriculum requirements for basic, specialized, and in-service courses and programs for the training of law enforcement officers. It must consult and cooperate with the counties, state agencies, other governmental agencies, universities and colleges, and other institutions, concerning the development of law enforcement officer training schools and programs. The board is also

APPENDIX A
responsible for regulating and enforcing the certification requirements of law enforcement officers.

These are important and substantial duties that require evaluation to ensure that existing legal obligations are not compromised. Before imposing new standards impacting the employment of law enforcement officers, the board must consider collective bargaining and other employment requirements. At a minimum, the board must evaluate how probationary periods; training requirements, including the types of training, the number of hours of training, and the availability of training facilities; and the issuance, suspension, and revocation of certification will impact obligations already established by law.

Such evaluation should include consideration of the study conducted by the legislative reference bureau pursuant to Act 124, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018, and any additional study necessary to determine the impact of uniform standards, certification, and training for all law enforcement. The board has determined that it will need significantly more time and funds to accomplish its mission.

The purpose of this Act is to:

(1) Clarify membership requirements for the law enforcement standards board to facilitate
(2) Enable the board to research the impact of uniform standards, certification, and training on existing legal requirements;

(3) Establish new deadlines for the completion of the board's significant responsibilities; and

(4) Appropriate funds to enable the board to accomplish its mission.

SECTION 2. Section 76-16, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended by amending subsection (b) to read as follows:

"(b) The civil service to which this chapter applies shall comprise all positions in the State now existing or hereafter established and embrace all personal services performed for the State, except the following:

(1) Commissioned and enlisted personnel of the Hawaii National Guard as such, and positions in the Hawaii National Guard that are required by state or federal laws or regulations or orders of the National Guard to be filled from those commissioned or enlisted personnel;

(2) Positions filled by persons employed by contract where the director of human resources development has certified that the service is special or unique or is
essential to the public interest and that, because of circumstances surrounding its fulfillment, personnel to perform the service cannot be obtained through normal civil service recruitment procedures. Any such contract may be for any period not exceeding one year;

(3) Positions that must be filled without delay to comply with a court order or decree if the director determines that recruitment through normal recruitment civil service procedures would result in delay or noncompliance, such as the Felix-Cayetano consent decree;

(4) Positions filled by the legislature or by either house or any committee thereof;

(5) Employees in the office of the governor and office of the lieutenant governor, and household employees at Washington Place;

(6) Positions filled by popular vote;

(7) Department heads, officers, and members of any board, commission, or other state agency whose appointments are made by the governor or are required by law to be confirmed by the senate;

(8) Judges, referees, receivers, masters, jurors,
notaries public, land court examiners, court
commissioners, and attorneys appointed by a state
court for a special temporary service;

(9) One bailiff for the chief justice of the supreme
court who shall have the powers and duties of a court
officer and bailiff under section 606-14; one
secretary or clerk for each justice of the supreme
court, each judge of the intermediate appellate court,
and each judge of the circuit court; one secretary for
the judicial council; one deputy administrative
director of the courts; three law clerks for the chief
justice of the supreme court, two law clerks for each
associate justice of the supreme court and each judge
of the intermediate appellate court, one law clerk for
each judge of the circuit court, two additional law
clerks for the civil administrative judge of the
circuit court of the first circuit, two additional law
clerks for the criminal administrative judge of the
circuit court of the first circuit, one additional law
clerk for the senior judge of the family court of the
first circuit, two additional law clerks for the civil
motions judge of the circuit court of the first
circuit, two additional law clerks for the criminal
motions judge of the circuit court of the first
circuit, and two law clerks for the administrative
judge of the district court of the first circuit; and
one private secretary for the administrative director
of the courts, the deputy administrative director of
the courts, each department head, each deputy or first
assistant, and each additional deputy, or assistant
deputy, or assistant defined in paragraph (16);
(10) First deputy and deputy attorneys general, the
administrative services manager of the department of
the attorney general, one secretary for the
administrative services manager, an administrator and
any support staff for the criminal and juvenile
justice resources coordination functions, and law
clers;
(11) (A) Teachers, principals, vice-principals,
complex area superintendents, deputy and
assistant superintendents, other certificated
personnel, not more than twenty noncertificated
administrative, professional, and technical
personnel not engaged in instructional work;
(B) Effective July 1, 2003, teaching assistants,
educational assistants, bilingual/bicultural
school-home assistants, school psychologists,
psychological examiners, speech pathologists,
athletic health care trainers, alternative school
work study assistants, alternative school
educational/supportive services specialists,
alternative school project coordinators, and
communications aides in the department of
education;

(C) The special assistant to the state librarian
and one secretary for the special assistant to
the state librarian; and

(D) Members of the faculty of the University of
Hawaii, including research workers, extension
agents, personnel engaged in instructional work,
and administrative, professional, and technical
personnel of the university;

(12) Employees engaged in special, research, or
demonstration projects approved by the governor;

(13) (A) Positions filled by inmates, patients of
state institutions, persons with severe physical
or mental disabilities participating in the work
experience training programs;
(B) Positions filled with students in accordance
with guidelines for established state employment
programs; and

(C) Positions that provide work experience
training or temporary public service employment
that are filled by persons entering the workforce
or persons transitioning into other careers under
programs such as the federal Workforce Investment
Act of 1998, as amended, or the Senior Community
Service Employment Program of the Employment and
Training Administration of the United States
Department of Labor, or under other similar state
programs;

(14) A custodian or guide at Iolani Palace, the Royal
Mausoleum, and Hulihee Palace;

(15) Positions filled by persons employed on a fee,
contract, or piecework basis, who may lawfully perform
their duties concurrently with their private business
or profession or other private employment and whose
duties require only a portion of their time, if it is
impracticable to ascertain or anticipate the portion
of time to be devoted to the service of the State;

(16) Positions of first deputies or first assistants of
each department head appointed under or in the manner provided in section 6, article V, of the Hawaii State Constitution; three additional deputies or assistants either in charge of the highways, harbors, and airports divisions or other functions within the department of transportation as may be assigned by the director of transportation, with the approval of the governor; four additional deputies in the department of health, each in charge of one of the following: behavioral health, environmental health, hospitals, and health resources administration, including other functions within the department as may be assigned by the director of health, with the approval of the governor; an administrative assistant to the state librarian; and an administrative assistant to the superintendent of education;

(17) Positions specifically exempted from this part by any other law; provided that:

(A) Any exemption created after July 1, 2014, shall expire three years after its enactment unless affirmatively extended by an act of the legislature; and

(B) All of the positions defined by paragraph (9)
shall be included in the position classification plan;

(18) Positions in the state foster grandparent program and positions for temporary employment of senior citizens in occupations in which there is a severe personnel shortage or in special projects;

(19) Household employees at the official residence of the president of the University of Hawaii;

(20) Employees in the department of education engaged in the supervision of students during meal periods in the distribution, collection, and counting of meal tickets, and in the cleaning of classrooms after school hours on a less than half-time basis;

(21) Employees hired under the tenant hire program of the Hawaii public housing authority; provided that not more than twenty-six per cent of the authority's workforce in any housing project maintained or operated by the authority shall be hired under the tenant hire program;

(22) Positions of the federally funded expanded food and nutrition program of the University of Hawaii that require the hiring of nutrition program assistants who live in the areas they serve;
Positions filled by persons with severe disabilities who are certified by the state vocational rehabilitation office that they are able to perform safely the duties of the positions;

The sheriff;

A gender and other fairness coordinator hired by the judiciary;

Positions in the Hawaii National Guard youth and adult education programs;

In the state energy office in the department of business, economic development, and tourism, all energy program managers, energy program specialists, energy program assistants, and energy analysts;

Administrative appeals hearing officers in the department of human services;

In the Med-QUEST division of the department of human services, the division administrator, finance officer, health care services branch administrator, medical director, and clinical standards administrator;

In the director's office of the department of human services, the enterprise officer, information security and privacy compliance officer, security and privacy
compliance engineer, and security and privacy compliance analyst; [and]

[(+)(31)[+] The Alzheimer's disease and related dementia services coordinator in the executive office on aging[−]; and

(32) The administrator for the law enforcement standards board.

The director shall determine the applicability of this section to specific positions.

Nothing in this section shall be deemed to affect the civil service status of any incumbent as it existed on July 1, 1955."

SECTION 3. Section 139-2, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended by amending subsections (a) and (b) to read as follows:

"(a) There is established the law enforcement standards board within the department of the attorney general for administrative purposes only. The purpose of the board shall be to provide programs and standards for training and certification of law enforcement officers. The law enforcement standards board shall consist of the following voting members: nine ex officio individuals[− two] or their designees, five law enforcement officers, and four members of the public.

(1) The nine ex officio members of the board shall consist of the:
(A) Attorney general[\_] or the attorney general's
designee;

(B) Director of public safety[\_] or the director's
designee;

(C) Director of transportation or the director's
designee;

(D) Chairperson of the board of land and natural
resources or the chairperson's designee;

(E) Director of taxation or the director's designee;

and

(F) Chiefs of police of the four counties[\_] or the
designees of each of the chiefs of police;

(2) The [two] five law enforcement officers shall [each]
be persons other than the chiefs of police or
designees described in paragraph (1)(F) and shall
consist of:

(A) One county law enforcement officer from each of
the four counties; and

(B) One state law enforcement officer.

Each law enforcement officer described in this
paragraph shall have at least ten years of experience
as a law enforcement officer [and] shall be appointed
by the governor[\_] , and, notwithstanding section 26-
shall serve without the advice and consent of the senate; and

(3) The public members shall consist of one member from each of the four counties, each of whom shall be appointed by the governor, and, notwithstanding section 26-34, shall serve without the advice and consent of the senate. At least two of the four members of the public holding a position on the board at any given time shall:

(A) Possess a master's or doctorate degree related to criminal justice;

(B) Possess a law degree and have experience:

   (i) Practicing in Hawaii as a deputy attorney general, a deputy prosecutor, a deputy public defender, or a private criminal defense attorney; or

   (ii) Litigating constitutional law issues in Hawaii;

(C) Be a recognized expert in the field of criminal justice, policing, or security; or

(D) Have work experience in a law enforcement capacity; provided that experience in a county
police department shall not itself be sufficient
to qualify under this paragraph].

(b) The law enforcement officers and the members of the
public on the board shall serve for a term of [three] four
years, provided that the initial terms shall be staggered, as
determined by the governor."

SECTION 4. Section 139-3, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is
amended to read as follows:

"§139-3 Powers and duties of the board. The board shall:

(1) Adopt rules in accordance with chapter 91 to implement
this chapter;

(2) Establish minimum standards for employment as a law
enforcement officer and to certify persons to be
qualified as law enforcement officers;

(3) Establish criteria and standards in which a person who
has been denied certification, whose certification has
been revoked by the board, or whose certification has
lapsed may reapply for certification;

(4) Establish minimum criminal justice curriculum
requirements for basic, specialized, and in-service
courses and programs for schools operated by or for
the State or a county for the specific purpose of
training law enforcement officers;
(5) Consult and cooperate with the counties, agencies of the State, other governmental agencies, universities, colleges, and other institutions concerning the development of law enforcement officer training schools and programs of criminal justice instruction;

(6) Employ[. subject to chapter 76,] an administrator, without regard to chapter 76, and other persons necessary to carry out its duties under this chapter;

(7) Investigate when there is reason to believe that a law enforcement officer does not meet the minimum standards for employment, and in so doing, may:
   (A) Subpoena persons, books, records, or documents;
   (B) Require answers in writing under oath to questions asked by the board; and
   (C) Take or cause to be taken depositions as needed in investigations, hearings, and other proceedings,

related to the investigation;

(8) Establish and require participation in continuing education programs for law enforcement officers;

(9) Have the authority to charge and collect fees for applications for certification as a law enforcement officer;
(10) Establish procedures and criteria for the revocation of certification issued by the board; (11) Have the authority to revoke certifications; [and] (12) Review and recommend statewide policies and procedures relating to law enforcement, including the use of force; (13) Consider studies relevant to the board's objectives, including but not limited to the study that examines consolidating the law enforcement activities and responsibilities of various state divisions and agencies under a single, centralized state enforcement division or agency, conducted pursuant to Act 124, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018; and (14) Conduct its own study to evaluate how to efficiently and effectively satisfy its duties in accordance with the law."

SECTION 5. Section 139-6, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended by amending subsections (a) and (b) to read as follows: "(a) No person may be appointed as a law enforcement officer after June 30, 2023, unless the person: (1) Has satisfactorily completed a basic program of law enforcement training approved by the board; and (2) Possesses other qualifications as prescribed by the
board for the employment of law enforcement officers, including minimum age, education, physical and mental standards, citizenship, good conduct, moral character, and experience.

(b) [The] Beginning on July 1, 2023, the board shall issue a certification to an applicant who meets the requirements of subsection (a) or who has satisfactorily completed a program or course of instruction in another jurisdiction that the board deems to be equivalent in content and quality to the requirements of subsection (a)."

SECTION 6. Section 139-7, Hawaii Revised Statutes, is amended to read as follows:

"§139-7 Employment of law enforcement officers. (a) No person shall be appointed or employed as a law enforcement officer by any county police department, the department of public safety, the department of transportation, the department of land and natural resources, the department of taxation, or the department of the attorney general, after June 30, 2023, unless the person possesses a valid certification issued by the board pursuant to section 139-6(b).

(b) This section shall not apply to a person [employed]:

(1) Employed on a probationary basis, except that
employment on a probationary basis may not exceed the period authorized for probationary employment as determined by the board[.]; or

(2) Who entered into employment with the applicable county police department or state department before July 1, 2023, and termination of employment would violate any valid collective bargaining agreement."

SECTION 7. Act 220, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018, as amended by section 5 of Act 47, Session Laws of Hawaii 2020, is amended by amending section 6 to read as follows:

"SECTION 6. This Act shall take effect on July 1, 2018[† provided that the law enforcement standards board established under this Act shall finalize its standards and certification process by December 31, 2021]."

SECTION 8. There is appropriated out of the general revenues of the State of Hawaii the sum of $292,500 or so much thereof as may be necessary for fiscal year 2021-2022 for deposit into the law enforcement standards board special fund.

SECTION 9. There is appropriated out of the law enforcement standards board special fund the sum of $292,500 or so much thereof as may be necessary for the fiscal year 2021-2022 for:
(1) One permanent full-time equivalent (1.0 FTE) administrator position exempt from chapter 76, Hawaii Revised Statutes, and one permanent full-time equivalent (1.0 FTE) clerical position subject to chapter 76, Hawaii Revised Statutes; and

(2) Copying and supply costs of the law enforcement standards board.

The sum appropriated shall be expended by the department of the attorney general, on behalf of the law enforcement standards board.

SECTION 10. This Act does not affect rights and duties that matured, penalties that were incurred, and proceedings that were begun, before the effective date of this Act.

SECTION 11. Statutory material to be repealed is bracketed and stricken. New statutory material is underscored.

SECTION 12. This Act shall take effect upon its approval.

INTRODUCED BY: _____________________________

BY REQUEST
Report Title:
Law Enforcement Standards Board

Description:
Clarifies membership and certain powers and duties of the Law Enforcement Standards Board, establishes new deadlines for the completion of board responsibilities, and provides appropriate funds and resources to enable the board to accomplish its mission.

The summary description of legislation appearing on this page is for informational purposes only and is not legislation or evidence of legislative intent.
DEPARTMENT: Attorney General

TITLE: A BILL FOR AN ACT RELATING TO LAW ENFORCEMENT.

PURPOSE: To clarify membership requirements for the law enforcement standards board, to enable the board to research the impact of standards, certification, and training requirements on existing legal requirements, to establish new deadlines for the completion of the board's responsibilities, to provide the necessary funds and resources for the board's mission, and to exempt the board administrator position from chapter 76.

MEANS: Amend sections 76-16(b), 139-2, 139-3, 139-6, and 139-7, Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS), and section 6 of Act 220, Session Laws of Hawaii 2018 ("Act 220").

JUSTIFICATION: The law enforcement standards board, established by section 139-2, HRS, has not received the funding, staff, and resources it needs to accomplish its mission. It also needs an extension of its deadlines. The board is responsible for establishing minimum standards for employment as a law enforcement officer and certifying persons qualified as law enforcement officers. It is also responsible for establishing minimum criminal justice curriculum requirements for basic, specialized, and in-service courses and programs for the training of law enforcement officers. It must consult and cooperate with the counties, state agencies, other governmental agencies, universities and colleges, and other institutions, concerning the development of law enforcement officer training schools and programs. The board is also responsible for regulating and enforcing the certification requirements of law enforcement officers.

APPENDIX A
Increasing the size of the board and allowing ex-officio members to use designees will expand the perspective of the board while increasing its operational flexibility.

Collective bargaining and employment laws and rules dictate various aspects of a law enforcement officer's career from start to finish. Explicitly authorizing the board to study and evaluate these laws, rules, and agreements will allow the board to establish standards, certifications and training requirements in a purposeful and intentional manner.

The board administrator position is being made exempt from civil service because the new board requires flexibility to meet its broad duties and responsibilities and tight deadlines. The board's role, and that of the administrator, are unique and not within the traditional civil service classification system. The board needs the discretion to hire or terminate without the burden of complying with civil service requirements.

Impact on the public: The public will benefit from careful consideration of the existing laws, rules and agreements by a better-resourced, larger, and more operationally flexible board. This should result in better standards, certification, and training requirements and thereby increase public confidence in law enforcement and improve public safety generally.

Impact on the department and other agencies: Approval of this bill will have a direct positive effect on the board's ability to execute its responsibilities.

Additionally, county police officers, state public safety officers, and employees with police powers at the Department of Transportation, Department of Land and...
Natural Resources, Department of the Attorney General, and Department of Taxation will all benefit from better standards, certification, and training requirements.

GENERAL FUND: $292,500.

OTHER FUNDS: None.

PPBS PROGRAM DESIGNATION: None.

OTHER AFFECTED AGENCIES: Department of Transportation, Department of Land and Natural Resources, and Department of Taxation.

EFFECTIVE DATE: Upon approval.